



MINUTES
Regular Meeting of the
Heritage Preservation Board
Tuesday, April 12, 2011, 7:00 PM
Edina Community Room
4801 50th Street West

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chair Joel Stegner, Chris Rofidal, Jean Rehkamp Larson, Ross Davis, David Anger, Terry Ahlstrom, Katherine McLellan and Lauren Thorson

MEMBERS ABSENT: Bob Schwartzbauer, Claudia Carr, Colleen Curran

STAFF PRESENT: Joyce Repya, Associate Planner

New Member, Terry Ahlstrom was introduced to the Board.

I. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES: March 8, 2011

Member Davis moved approval of the minutes from the March 8, 2011 meeting. Member Rofidal seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

II. COUNTRY CLUB DISTRICT: Certificates of Appropriateness (COA)

A. H-11-01 4628 Casco Avenue – New Detached Garage

Planner Repya reported that the subject property is located on the west side of the 4600 block of Casco Avenue. The existing Tudor Revival style home was constructed in 1928 and currently has a 2-car detached garage accessed by a driveway on the south side of the property.

The Certificate of Appropriateness request involves demolishing the existing 367.6 square foot 2-stall garage located five feet from the side and rear lot lines, and building a new, 462.25 square foot detached garage in approximately the same location, but closer (3.5 feet) to each lot line, providing for a more livable rear yard. A new curb cut will not be required since the proposed garage will be accessed by the existing driveway.

The proposed garage demonstrates a design that compliments the Tudor Revival architectural style of the home with stucco clad walls and half timbering, a designer overhead door and an asphalt shingled roof. Attention to detail is demonstrated on the south, east and west elevations. The north elevation does not show similar architectural detailing because it directly abuts a privacy fence.

The height of the garage is shown to be 18 feet at the highest peak which is less than the average 21.2 foot height of surrounding detached garages. The height at the mid-point of the gable is shown to be 12'1", and a height of 7'10" is provided at the eave line. The ridge line is shown to be 22'4" in length.

The applicant has provided the plans for an addition to the rear of the home that was started in November, 2010. At the time the building permit was pulled, the proposed detached garage was not part of the plan, thus a COA was not required for the project. At this time, plans for the addition are included for the HPB's information.

Preservation Consultant Robert Vogel reviewed the plans and provided a report which stated that existing house at 4628 Casco contributes to the historic significance of the Country Club District as a whole, but is not individually eligible for designation as an Edina Heritage Landmark. The existing detached garage is not considered historic and is not a heritage preservation resource; therefore, demolition would be an appropriate undertaking. Regarding the proposed new construction, detached garages are common in the Country Club District and the district plan of treatment recognizes construction of new garages as appropriate, provided the new garage is compatible in scale, size, massing, building materials, and texture with the historic house and other buildings in the neighborhood.

Mr. Vogel added that the plans submitted indicate the new garage will match the Tudor Revival style of the house and be architecturally compatible with other historic residences in the neighborhood. The north elevation is shown as an undecorated stucco wall, which will be screened from the adjoining property by the existing privacy fence. The proposed design is consistent with the height and scale of the garages on adjacent properties; and the essential character of the subject property and the district as a whole will be preserved intact. In his evaluation, Mr. Vogel concluded that he recommended approval of the request.

Ms. Repya stated that she concurred with Consultant Vogel's recommendation to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new garage, pointing out that the plans are not unlike those previously reviewed for homes in the Country Club District, and will enhance both the subject property as well as the neighborhood at large. Furthermore, the proposed plans demonstrate the homeowner's desire to provide for a more livable home and rear yard.

The recommendation for approval should be subject to the plans presented, and a year built (2011) plaque or sign is placed on the new detached garage.

Findings supporting the approval recommendation include:

- The plans provided with the subject request clearly illustrate the scale and scope of the project, and
- The information provided supporting the subject Certificate of Appropriateness meets the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance and the Country Club District Plan of Treatment.

Board Member Comments

Member Davis opined that the proposed plans are a definite improvement over the existing garage and he would be very comfortable voting for approval.

Member Rofidal recognized that the proposed plan is very similar to several new garages the Board has approved on Casco Avenue. He added that the application package was one of the best received thus far. Board members agreed, suggesting that it be used as a sample for future applicants.

Members Anger and Ahlstrom observed that the plan was very handsome; fitting well within the neighborhood.

Member Rehkamp Larson stated that the height and scale of the proposed garage is very good. She observed that the timber detailing on the front of the garage is not proposed for the rear of the structure – the remainder of the Board did not have an issue with that exclusion.

Member Stegner questioned the north (side) elevation that lacked the architectural detailing

usually required. He stated that he understood the applicant's rationale for not providing a window - because a privacy fence provides relief for the structure, but wondered who owned the fence. Dan Krieter, of Matthias K. Builders, representing the homeowners explained that the fence belongs to the neighbors to the north. Board members agreed that because the northerly neighbor controls the fence, they did not see it to be a problem.

Motion & Vote

Member Davis moved approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to construct the new detached garage in the rear yard, subject to the conditions recommended by Staff. Member Anger seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

III. 2011 HERITAGE AWARD:

Planner Repya reported that following two nominations had been received for the Heritage Award:

#1 4801 Maple Road Farrell-Smith Residence.

Submitted by Steve Kuhl, of Kuhl Design Build
(Designer of 2010 award recipient)

Summary: This 1950's rambler was redesigned with sensitivity to both tradition and historical precedence. The small addition to the rear of the home included a new kitchen, mudroom and bathroom. The goal of the design was to ensure that the addition appropriately massed for the surroundings.

#2 4439 W. 50th Street St. Stephen's Episcopal Church - 75th Anniversary

Submitted by David Anger

Summary: St. Stephen's Episcopal Church, celebrating its 75th Anniversary this year has been a significant landmark in northeast Edina since it was first organized in 1936. Shortly after Samuel Thorpe developed the Country Club District neighborhood in 1924, a small Episcopal congregation began holding services in the neighborhood Wooddale School. As the congregation grew, so did the plans for a church home which in 1937, was built across West 50th Street, on the site of the Minnehaha Grange Hall (which was moved to Normandale Road and W. 50th Street). The church design was based on Wales-St. Stephen the Martyr, Old Radnor, a 15th century stone church located in the United Kingdom.

As a nod to its mother church, in 1987, St. Stephen's built two replica concert-quality Dobson organs to observe their 50th anniversary. Currently, the organs which can play solo, or in tandem are undergoing restoration in preparation for the church's 75th Anniversary celebration this fall.

Originally nominated for the award in 2009, at that time, the HPB noted that while they voted to nominate another property, all agreed that St. Stephen's Episcopal Church is a well preserved landmark in the community and worthy of the award in the future.

Board Discussion & Vote

Board members were very excited about the St. Stephen's Episcopal Church nomination; pointing out that since the church was first built in the 1930's, there have been several additions, however one would be hard pressed to find the line where the original church ends and the additions begin. All agreed that this sensitivity to the historic integrity of the original structure

should be recognized and celebrated.

Regarding the second nomination, board members commended Steve Kuhl, who nominated 4801 Maple Road for his sensitivity to tradition and historical precedence in his work, as well as his interest in the Heritage Award program. The Board discussed that the nomination did not provide many details of the project, and since Kuhl Design Build was awarded the Heritage Award in 2010, it made sense to present the award to others at this time.

Member Rofidal moved to present the 2011 Edina Heritage Award to St. Stephen's Episcopal Church on its 75th Anniversary, recognizing the sensitivity to the historic integrity of the original church and its location with each improvement project they have undertaken. Member Ahlstrom seconded the motion. All voted aye. The motion carried.

IV. COMMUNITY COMMENT: None

V. 2011 GOALS & OBJECTIVES:

The Board considered the following list of proposed goals and objectives for 2011:

- 1) Complete the CLG grant-funded thematic study of heritage resources associated with Edina women.
- 2) Revise and update Historic Context Study to reflect changes since 1999.
- 3) Process Certificate of Appropriateness applications for proposed changes to properties designated Edina Heritage Landmarks.
- 4) Nominate at least one designated eligible property for heritage landmark designation.
- 5) Nominate Morningside bungalow properties for heritage landmark designation on a first-come-first-served basis.
- 6) Apply for Legacy Grant funds to improve accessibility to the historic Cahill School and Grange Hall at Tupa Park.
- 7) Provide Heritage Preservation Board members and staff with information, education and training in historic preservation.
- 8) Sponsor Preservation Month (May) activities.
 - a) City Council Proclamation – May, Preservation Month
 - a) Heritage Award Presentation
 - b) Grange Hall/Cahill School Open House
- 9) Advise and assist historic property owners in building conservation and rehabilitation matters.
- 10) One or more members attend the 31st Annual Minnesota Preservation Conference – September 22-23, in Faribault, MN.

Board members agreed that the goals and objectives provided a good representation of the work plan for 2011. Chairman Stegner suggested categorizing the items into one of the following three areas: Research, Education, and Preservation. Discussion ensued regarding which category best suited each work item. Planner Repya agreed to provide an updated work plan reflecting the division into the three respective categories.

Reflecting on future projects to be considered, the Board added the following items to be considered during 2011:

- Referring to item #2, when updating the Historic Context Study, originally written in 1998, ensure that it reflects studies completed in the Country Club District and Morningside neighborhood; and

- Expand the scope of the Historic Context Study which stopped in 1974, to address the community through the year 2000.
- Add a section to the Historic Context Study to address the Mid-Century development of the city (post World War II - 1970); a period when Edina experienced its greatest growth.
- In keeping with the Mid-Century period, compile a list of significant commercial and residential properties representative of the Mid-Century architectural style.
- Regarding on the "Education" category of the work plan, Chairman Stegner encouraged the Board to attend workshops, seminars and conferences which could enhance their effectiveness on the HPB. Planner Repya pointed out that the Planning Department does have a budget for conferences which could be tapped into to defray expenses.

Board members agreed that the 2011 work plan was shaping up nicely, and they looked forward to continuing to refine it during the year.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS:

A. Southdale Mall - Member Davis reported that as promised at the March HPB meeting, he met with the manager of the Southdale Mall to discuss the potential for identifying historic elements of the mall's interior (such as the original clock, sculptures, etc.) The manager indicated that they would consider entertaining a recognition of historic elements, if they could derive a benefit.

The Board was encouraged that the mall was willing to discuss the potential for recognizing historic elements; and wondered if the mall management would provide a tour for the HPB. All thanked Member Davis for his follow-up with the Southdale Mall management, and agreed that they looked forward to a continuing dialogue.

B. Grandview Square Small Area Study – Member Rofidal reported that the kick-off for the Grandview Small Area Study will begin on Thursday, April 14th with a second meeting on Thursday, April 21st. At both of those meetings, the public will have an opportunity to participate in the planning process for the Grandview area. Rofidal pointed out that he is representing the HPB on the committee, however anyone interested in participating is welcome to attend.

VII. CORRESPONDENCE: None

VIII. NEXT MEETING DATE: May 10, 2011
May 17, 2011 – Joint Meeting with City Council

IX. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 8:30 pm

Respectfully submitted,

Joyce Repya